Oxygen-Saturation Targets for Critically III Adults Receiving Mechanical Ventilation: An embedded cluster-crossover trial

Matthew W. Semler, MD, MSc Vanderbilt University Medical Center



Disclosures

- Funding:
- NHLBI K23HL143053 Oxygen Saturation Targets during Mechanical Ventilation for Critically Ill Adults
- NIA R21AG063126

Cognitive Outcomes in the Pragmatic Investigation of Optimal Oxygen Targets

• Conflicts of Interest:

None

Overview

- Background
- Trial Design Considerations
- Methods
- Results
- Discussion



Oxygenation during mechanical ventilation

- >3 million mechanically ventilated ICU patients in US each year
- Universally involves titrating oxygen (FiO2) to maintain oxygenation
- Oxygenation target that optimizes outcomes has been unknown

Oxygenation target options



Oxygenation target physiology

| Pro |
|-----|
|-----|

May avoid excess FiO2, hyperoxemia, hyperoxia

May avoid both hyperoxia and hypoxia (U-shaped curve)

May avoid hypoxia

Con

Hypoxia – impedes ATP production, generates ROI, necrosis & apoptosis

May incur risk of both hyperoxia and hypoxia

Excess FiO₂, - direct lung toxicity Hyperoxemia - vasoconstriction Hyperoxia – ROI, peroxidation, DNA damage

| | | | LOWER TA | ARGET | | INTERM | IEDIATE T/ | ARGET | | HIG | HER TARG | ET | |
|------------------|-----|-----|----------|-------|-----|--------|------------|-------|-----|-----|----------|-----|------|
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| SpO ₂ | 88% | 89% | 90% | 91% | 92% | 93% | 94% | 95% | 96% | 97% | 98% | 99% | 100% |
| | 55 | 57 | 60 | 62 | 65 | 69 | 73 | 79 | 86 | 96 | >110 | | |

Oxygenation target guidance

British Thoracic Society

Thoracic Society of Australia and New Zealand



O'Driscoll, Thorax, 2017

Aim of the PILOT trial

• Determine the effects of lower, intermediate, and higher SpO₂ targets on clinical outcomes for mechanically ventilated critically ill adults.



Trial Design Considerations



2nd Trial Design Choice: Early Intervention



Emergency department hyperoxia associated with increased mortality in mechanically ventilated patients: a cohort study



3rd Trial Design Choice: Target SpO₂

Big Data for Clinical Trials: Automated Collection of SpO₂ for a Trial of Oxygen Targets during Mechanical Ventilation

| | SpO ₂ measured | PaO ₂ measured |
|-------|---------------------------|---------------------------|
| Day 1 | Every 1 minute | 24% of patients |
| Day 2 | Every 1 minute | 13% of patients |
| Day 3 | Every 1 minute | 10% of patients |
| Day 4 | Every 1 minute | 8% of patients |
| Day 5 | Every 1 minute | 6% of patients |
| Day 6 | Every 1 minute | 5% of patients |
| Day 7 | Every 1 minute | 4% of patients |

4^{the} Trial Design Choice: Cluster-Crossover

Rationale for cluster-level allocation

- Emulate management in clinical care
 - Titration of FiO₂ for all patients in unit by 2-4 respiratory therapists
 - Management of ventilator via unit-wide protocols (e.g., TV, PEEP, SBT)
- Enrollment immediately at initiation of mechanical ventilation
 - Minimize pre-study exposure to excess FiO2, hyperoxemia, hyperoxia
 - Facilitate on-study separation between groups

Rationale for number of crossovers

How many times should a cluster randomized crossover trial cross over?



Methods

PILOT Trial Design

- Pragmatic, unblinded, cluster-randomized, cluster-crossover trial
 - Initiated by the investigators
 - Funded by the NIH/NHLBI
 - Approved by the Institutional Review Board at Vanderbilt University
 - Registered prior to initiation (NCT03537937)
 - Overseen by independent Data and Safety Monitoring Board (DSMB)
- Enrollment (36 months)
 - Began: July 1 2018
 - Paused: April 1 2020 until May 31 2020 due to the COVID-19 pandemic
 - Concluded: August 31 2021

Study Sites and Patients

- Study Sites
 - Emergency department & medical intensive care unit at Vanderbilt
- Patients
 - All adults in medical ICU or in ED with planned medical ICU admission
 - Enrolled at the time of the first receipt of invasive mechanical ventilation
 - Excluded:
 - Age < 18 years
 - Pregnant
 - Prisoner

Randomization and Treatment Allocation

- Cluster-level allocation: All patients in the ED & ICU were assigned together to an SpO₂ target
- Cluster-level crossover: Every two months, the ED & ICU switched together between SpO₂ targets in a sequence generated by computerized randomization using permuted blocks of 3 to minimize impact of seasonal variation
- Washout period: last 7 days of each two-month period

| Study Year 1 | | | | Study Year 2 | | | | Study Year 3 | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Jul- Aug | Sep- Oct | Nov- Dec | Jan- Feb | Mar- Apr | May- Jun | Jul- Aug | Sep- Oct | Nov- Dec | Jan- Feb | Mar & Jun | Jul- Aug | Sept- Oct | Nov- Dec | Jan- Feb | Mar- Apr | May- Jun | Jul- Aug |
| 2018 2019 | | | | 19 2020 | | | | 2021 | | | | | | | | | |
| Н | I | L | I | L | Н | L | I | Н | Н | I | L | I | Н | L | I | Н | L |

H = Higher; I = Intermediate; L = Lower SpO_2 target group

Informed Consent

- 1. Patients were enrolled under waiver of informed consent
 - Minimal risk
 - Compared 3 approaches common in clinical care
 - Trial only determined target for patients for whom clinicians were uncertain which target would be best and felt all 3 were reasonable
 - If clinicians felt that the optimal target known for a given patient, that target was used
 - Impracticable to obtain informed consent from every patient in the ED & ICU prior to emergency tracheal intubation & initiation of mechanical ventilation
- 2. Patients and families were notified of participation with an IRBapproved information sheet
- 3. Patients or their legally-authorized representatives were approached for informed consent for assessment of long-term outcomes as a part of the independently-funded CO-PILOT study

No research-specific study procedures (e.g., blood draws)

Intervention

- Respiratory therapists titrated FiO2 to achieve SpO2
 - Beginning within 15 minutes of initiation of mechanical ventilation
 - Ending at discontinuation from mechanical ventilation or transfer
 - Except: during transport, procedures, or spontaneous breathing trials

| Study Group | SpO ₂ target | SpO ₂ range | PaO ₂ target | PaO ₂ range |
|--------------------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|
| Lower SpO ₂ target | 90% | 88-92% | 60 mm Hg | 55-65 mm Hg |
| Intermediate SpO ₂ target | 94% | 92-96% | 70 mm Hg | 65-80 mm Hg |
| Higher SpO ₂ target | 98% | 96-100% | 110 mm Hg | > 80 mm Hg |

Other interventions

- Modification of the SpO2 target
 - If a clinician, patient, or family member determined that an oxygenation target other than the assigned target would be best for the patient, that target was used (and the reason was recorded)
- Institutional protocols and clinicians determined
 - Tidal volume, PEEP, blood gas measurement
 - Analgesia, sedation
 - Timing of SAT, SBT, and extubation

Data collection

- Study personnel
 - Baseline characteristics, on-study management, in-hospital outcomes
- Automated extraction from bedside monitor
 - SpO₂, FiO₂, ventilator settings every 1 minute



Outcomes

- Primary Outcome: Ventilator-free days
 - Days alive and free of mechanical ventilation through study day 28
- Secondary Outcome: In-hospital mortality
 - Death from any cause prior to day 28, censored at hospital discharge

• Exploratory

- Clinical: ICU mortality, vasopressor-free days, RRT-free days, ICU-free days
- Organ Function: Non-respiratory SOFA score, creatinine, lactate, AKI
- Safety: Arrhythmia, cardiac arrest, pneumothorax, stroke, MI

Sample Size

- Assumptions:
 - 2,250 patients over 36 months
 - Median ventilator-free days of 22 [IQR, 0-25]
 - Intra-cluster intra-period correlation of 0.01
 - Alpha of 0.05
- 92% power to detect a difference of 2 ventilator-free days

Statistical Analysis

- Primary Analysis
 - All enrolled patients EXCEPT
 - Admitted during washout period
 - Laboratory-confirmed COVID-19 majority of trial occurred before pandemic and COVID-19 patients were cared for in a separate COVID ICU not participating in the trial
 - Proportional odds model
 - Dependent variable: ventilator-free days
 - Independent variables: group (lower vs intermediate vs higher) and time





2,541 patients

| Table 1. Characteristics of the Patients at Baseline.* | | | |
|--|---|--|--|
| Characteristic | Lower Spo ₂ Target (N=808) | Intermediate Spo ₂ Target (N=859) | Higher Spo ₂ Target (N = 874) |
| Median age (IQR) — yr | 57 (44–67) | 59 (47–68) | 59 (45–68) |
| Female sex — no. (%) | 361 (44.7) | 385 (44.8) | 409 (46.8) |
| Race or ethnic group — no. (%)† | | | |
| White | 649 (80.3) | 666 (77.5) | 695 (79.5) |
| Black | 121 (15.0) | 140 (16.3) | 136 (15.6) |
| Other | 38 (4.7) | 53 (6.2) | 43 (4.9) |
| Median time from initiation of mechanical ventilation to enrollment (IQR) — hr‡ | 0.0 (0.0-4.9) | 0.0 (0.0-4.5) | 0.0 (0.0–5.5) |
| Location at enrollment — no. (%) | | | |
| Emergency department | 280 (34.7) | 313 (36.4) | 282 (32.3) |
| Intensive care unit | 528 (65.3) | 546 (63.6) | 592 (67.7) |
| Coexisting conditions — no. (%) | | | |
| Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease | 148 (18.3) | 175 (20.4) | 169 (19.3) |
| Coronary artery disease | 145 (17.9) | 152 (17.7) | 178 (20.4) |
| End-stage kidney disease, receiving RRT | 52 (6.4) | 46 (5.4) | 39 (4.5) |
| Acute illnesses§ | | | |
| Cardiac arrest — no. (%) | 125 (15.5) | 100 (11.6) | 109 (12.5) |
| Acute myocardial infarction — no. (%) | 136 (16.8) | 138 (16.1) | 145 (16.6) |
| Sepsis or septic shock — no. (%) | 275 (34.0) | 247 (28.8) | 283 (32.4) |
| Stage ≥II acute kidney injury — no./total no. (%) | 231/756 (30.6) | 248/813 (30.5) | 243/835 (29.1) |
| Receipt of vasopressors — no. (%) | 160 (19.8) | 171 (19.9) | 153 (17.5) |
| Median nonrespiratory SOFA score (IQR)¶ | 5 (4-8) | 5 (4-8) | 5 (3-8) |

Separation between groups in SpO2



Days

| | Lower | Intermediate | Higher |
|---|-------|--------------|--------|
| SpO ₂ of 99-100% on FiO ₂ >0.21 | 6% | 8% | 33% |
| SpO ₂ < 85% | 0.8% | 0.6% | 0.9% |

Separation between groups in FiO2



Days

| | Lower | Intermediate | Higher |
|--------------|-------|--------------|-------------|
| FiO2 ≥ 0.40 | 33% | 45% | 69 % |
| FiO2 of 0.21 | 34% | 22% | 4% |

Primary Outcome

Primary Outcome





P value for a difference between 3 groups = 0.81

No differences in any subgroup



No differences in any subgroup

| | | Lower | Intermediate | Higher | Lower vs Intermediate | Intermediate vs Higher | Lower vs Higher |
|-----------------------------------|------|------------------------|--------------|------------------------|--------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|
| Subgroup* | n | (n=808) | (n=859) | (n=874) | OR (95% CI) | OR (95% CI) | OR (95% CI) |
| | | | | | | | |
| Race | | | | | | | |
| Hispanic | 45 | 22 [0-26] | 23 [0-25] | 23 <mark>[3-26]</mark> | 1.11 (0.27-4.62) | 0.70 (0.15-3.32) | 0.77 (0.22-2.66) |
| Non-Hispanic Black | 392 | 18 <mark>[0-25]</mark> | 22 [0-26] | 21 <mark>[0-25]</mark> | 0.71 (0.46-1.10) | 1.13 (0.74-1.71) | 0.80 (0.51-1.24) |
| Non-Hispanic White | 1940 | 21 [0-26] | 21 [0-25] | 21 <mark>[0-26]</mark> | 0.97 (0.79-1.19) | 1.03 (0.84-1.26) | 1.00 (0.81-1.23) |
| Other | 164 | 12 [0-25] | 6 [0-25] | 22 <mark>[0-26]</mark> | 1.22 (0.59-2.49) | 0.59 (0.30-1.14) | 0.71 (0.33-1.52) |
| Source of admission to the ICU | | | | | | | |
| Emergency department | 1194 | 23 [0-26] | 23 [0-26] | 24 <mark>[0-26]</mark> | 0.95 (0.74-1.22) | 0.82 [0.64-1.06] | 0.78 [0.6-1.02] |
| Transfer from another hospital | 651 | 19 [0-25] | 19 [0-25] | 17 [0-24] | 0.98 (0.68-1.39) | 1.33 (0.95-1.87) | 1.30 (0.92-1.83) |
| Hospital ward | 338 | 0 [0-22] | 0 [0-23] | 0 [0-23] | 0.71 (0.42-1.21) | 1.12 (0.68-1.86) | 0.80 (0.47-1.35) |
| Another ICU within the hospital | 205 | 14 [0-25] | 14 [0-24] | 18 [0-24] | 1.09 (0.59-2.03) | 0.96 (0.55-1.69) | 1.05 (0.56-1.96) |
| Operating room | 153 | 25 [0-26] | 24 [0-26] | 25 [4-26] | 1.07 (0.53-2.17) | 0.63 (0.31-1.30) | 0.68 (0.33-1.37) |
| Home supplemental oxygen | | | | | | | |
| Yes | 362 | 13 [0-25] | 7 [0-25] | 15 [0-25] | 1.08 (0.68-1.74) | 0.84 (0.53-1.33) | 0.91 (0.56-1.47) |
| No | 2172 | 21 [0-25] | 21 [0-26] | 21 [0-26] | 0.92 (0.76-1.11) | 1.02 (0.85-1.24) | 0.94 (0.77-1.15) |
| Coronary disease or heart failure | | | | | | | |
| Yes | 524 | 18 [0-25] | 17 [0-25] | 19 [0-25] | 1.04 (0.70-1.54) | 1.01 (0.70-1.48) | 1.05 (0.72-1.55) |
| No | 2017 | 21 [0-26] | 21 [0-25] | 21 [0-26] | 0.93 (0.76-1.13) | 0.98 (0.81-1.20) | 0.91 (0.74-1.13) |

Secondary, Exploratory, Safety Outcomes

| | Lower | Intermediate | Higher | Lower vs Higher OR (95% CI) |
|-----------------------|-----------|--------------|-----------|--------------------------------|
| In-hospital mortality | 34.8% | 34.0% | 33.2% | 1.16 (0.93-1.45) |
| | | | | |
| Stage II-III AKI | 30.4% | 30.8% | 30.0% | 0.99 (0.78-1.25) |
| Receipt of RRT | 14.8% | 14.5% | 11.6% | 1.28 (0.93-1.77) |
| RRT-free days | 28 [0-28] | 28 [0-28] | 28 [0-28] | 0.88 (0.71-1.08) |
| Vasopressor-free days | 25 [0-28] | 25 [0-28] | 25 [0-28] | 0.87 (0.72-1.05) |
| ICU-free days | 20 [0-24] | 19 [0-24] | 20 [0-24] | 0.94 (0.78-1.14) |
| Hospital-free days | 10 [0-20] | 11 [0-21] | 10 [0-20] | 0.98 (0.81-1.19) |

No differences in cardiac arrest, arrhythmia, MI, stroke, or pneumothorax

Discussion

Comparison to prior trials

| Trial characteristic | PILOT | HOT-ICU | ICU-ROX | Oxygen-ICU | O ₂ -ICU | LOCO-2 |
|---|---|---|--|---------------------|---|---|
| Patients ventilated at enrollment | 2,541 | 1,704 | 965 | 291 | 295 | 201 |
| Time-to-enrollment | At initiation of ventilation in ED or ICU | Median of 4 hours after ICU admission | After ICU admission, median 3 hours after ventilation | At ICU admission | Median of 4 hours after ICU admission | After ICU admission, exact interval not reported |
| Target | SpO ₂ | PaO ₂ | SpO ₂ | PaO ₂ | PaO ₂ | PaO ₂ |
| SpO ₂ target in lower group | 90% | About 90% | 91-96% | 94-98% | About 90-97% | 88-92% |
| SpO ₂ target in higher group | 98% | About 97% | 91-100% | 97-100% | About 98-100% | 96-100% |
| Oxygenation achieved | | | | | | |
| Median SpO ₂ in lower group | 94% | 93% | Not reported | Not reported | 96% | About 93% |
| Median SpO ₂ in higher group | 97% | 96% | Not reported | Not reported | 97% | About 97% |
| Difference between groups | -3% | -3% | Not reported | Not reported | -1% | -3.8% |
| Median FiO ₂ in lower group | 0.31 | 0.43 | About 0.30 | 0.36 | 0.40 | About 0.40 |
| Median FiO ₂ in higher group | 0.45 | 0.56 | About 0.35 | 0.39 | 0.51 | About 0.50 |
| Difference between groups | -0.15 | -0.13 | About -0.05 | -0.03 | -0.09 | -0.15 |
| Mortality | In-hospital (28d) | 90 days | 90 days | In-hospital | In-hospital | 28 days |
| In lower target group | 34.8% | 42.9% | 34.7% | 24.2% | 32.2% | 34.3% |
| In higher target group | 33.2% | 42.4% | 32.5% | 33.9% | 31.3% | 26.5% |
| Difference between groups | 1.6% | 0.5% | 2.2% | -9.7% | 0.9% | 7.8% |

| Trial characteristic | PILOT | HOT-ICU | ICU-ROX | Oxygen-ICU | O ₂ -ICU | LOCO-2 |
|---|---|---|--|---------------------|---|---|
| Patients ventilated at enrollment | 2,541 | 1,704 | 965 | 291 | 295 | 201 |
| Time-to-enrollment | At initiation of ventilation in ED or ICU | Median of 4 hours after ICU admission | After ICU admission, median 3 hours after ventilation | At ICU admission | Median of 4 hours after ICU admission | After ICU admission, exact interval not reported |
| Target | SpO ₂ | PaO ₂ | SpO ₂ | PaO ₂ | PaO ₂ | PaO ₂ |
| SpO ₂ target in lower group | 90% | About 90% | 91-96% | 94-98% | About 90-97% | 88-92% |
| SpO ₂ target in higher group | 98% | About 97% | 91-100% | 97-100% | About 98-100% | 96-100% |
| Oxygenation achieved | | | | | | |
| Median SpO ₂ in lower group | 94% | 93% | Not reported | Not reported | 96% | About 93% |
| Median SpO ₂ in higher group | 97% | 96% | Not reported | Not reported | 97% | About 97% |
| Difference between groups | -3% | -3% | Not reported | Not reported | -1% | -3.8% |
| Median FiO ₂ in lower group | 0.31 | 0.43 | About 0.30 | 0.36 | 0.40 | About 0.40 |
| Median FiO ₂ in higher group | 0.45 | 0.56 | About 0.35 | 0.39 | 0.51 | About 0.50 |
| Difference between groups | -0.15 | -0.13 | About -0.05 | -0.03 | -0.09 | -0.15 |
| Mortality | In-hospital (28d) | 90 days | 90 days | In-hospital | In-hospital | 28 days |
| In lower target group | 34.8% | 42.9% | 34.7% | 24.2% | 32.2% | 34.3% |
| In higher target group | 33.2% | 42.4% | 32.5% | 33.9% | 31.3% | 26.5% |
| Difference between groups | 1.6% | 0.5% | 2.2% | -9.7% | 0.9% | 7.8% |

| Trial characteristic | PILOT | HOT-ICU | ICU-ROX | Oxygen-ICU | O ₂ -ICU | LOCO-2 |
|---|---|---|--|---------------------|---|---|
| Patients ventilated at enrollment | 2,541 | 1,704 | 965 | 291 | 295 | 201 |
| Time-to-enrollment | At initiation of ventilation in ED or ICU | Median of 4 hours after ICU admission | After ICU admission, median 3 hours after ventilation | At ICU admission | Median of 4 hours after ICU admission | After ICU admission, exact interval not reported |
| Target | SpO ₂ | PaO ₂ | SpO ₂ | PaO ₂ | PaO ₂ | PaO ₂ |
| SpO ₂ target in lower group | 90% | About 90% | 91-96% | 94-98% | About 90-97% | 88-92% |
| SpO ₂ target in higher group | 98% | About 97% | 91-100% | 97-100% | About 98-100% | 96-100% |
| Oxygenation achieved | | | | | | |
| Median SpO ₂ in lower group | 94% | 93% | Not reported | Not reported | 96% | About 93% |
| Median SpO ₂ in higher group | 97% | 96% | Not reported | Not reported | 97% | About 97% |
| Difference between groups | -3% | -3% | Not reported | Not reported | -1% | -3.8% |
| Median FiO ₂ in lower group | 0.31 | 0.43 | About 0.30 | 0.36 | 0.40 | About 0.40 |
| Median FiO ₂ in higher group | 0.45 | 0.56 | About 0.35 | 0.39 | 0.51 | About 0.50 |
| Difference between groups | -0.15 | -0.13 | About -0.05 | -0.03 | -0.09 | -0.15 |
| Mortality | In-hospital (28d) | 90 days | 90 days | In-hospital | In-hospital | 28 days |
| In lower target group | 34.8% | 42.9% | 34.7% | 24.2% | 32.2% | 34.3% |
| In higher target group | 33.2% | 42.4% | 32.5% | 33.9% | 31.3% | 26.5% |
| Difference between groups | 1.6% | 0.5% | 2.2% | -9.7% | 0.9% | 7.8% |

| Trial characteristic | PILOT | HOT-ICU | ICU-ROX | Oxygen-ICU | O ₂ -ICU | LOCO-2 |
|---|---|---|--|---------------------|---|---|
| Patients ventilated at enrollment | 2,541 | 1,704 | 965 | 291 | 295 | 201 |
| Time-to-enrollment | At initiation of ventilation in ED or ICU | Median of 4 hours after ICU admission | After ICU admission, median 3 hours after ventilation | At ICU admission | Median of 4 hours after ICU admission | After ICU admission, exact interval not reported |
| Target | SpO ₂ | PaO ₂ | SpO ₂ | PaO ₂ | PaO ₂ | PaO ₂ |
| SpO ₂ target in lower group | 90% | About 90% | 91-96% | 94-98% | About 90-97% | 88-92% |
| SpO ₂ target in higher group | 98% | About 97% | 91-100% | 97-100% | About 98-100% | 96-100% |
| Oxygenation achieved | | | | | | |
| Median SpO ₂ in lower group | 94% | 93% | Not reported | Not reported | 96% | About 93% |
| Median SpO ₂ in higher group | 97% | 96% | Not reported | Not reported | 97% | About 97% |
| Difference between groups | -3% | -3% | Not reported | Not reported | -1% | -3.8% |
| Median FiO ₂ in lower group | 0.31 | 0.43 | About 0.30 | 0.36 | 0.40 | About 0.40 |
| Median FiO ₂ in higher group | 0.45 | 0.56 | About 0.35 | 0.39 | 0.51 | About 0.50 |
| Difference between groups | -0.15 | -0.13 | About -0.05 | -0.03 | -0.09 | -0.15 |
| Mortality | In-hospital (28d) | 90 days | 90 days | In-hospital | In-hospital | 28 days |
| In lower target group | 34.8% | 42.9% | 34.7% | 24.2% | 32.2% | 34.3% |
| In higher target group | 33.2% | 42.4% | 32.5% | 33.9% | 31.3% | 26.5% |
| Difference between groups | 1.6% | 0.5% | 2.2% | -9.7% | 0.9% | 7.8% |

| Trial characteristic | PILOT | HOT-ICU | ICU-ROX | Oxygen-ICU | O ₂ -ICU | LOCO-2 |
|---|---|---|--|---------------------|---|---|
| Patients ventilated at enrollment | 2,541 | 1,704 | 965 | 291 | 295 | 201 |
| Time-to-enrollment | At initiation of ventilation in ED or ICU | Median of 4 hours after ICU admission | After ICU admission, median 3 hours after ventilation | At ICU admission | Median of 4 hours after ICU admission | After ICU admission, exact interval not reported |
| Target | SpO ₂ | PaO ₂ | SpO ₂ | PaO ₂ | PaO ₂ | PaO ₂ |
| SpO ₂ target in lower group | 90% | About 90% | 91-96% | 94-98% | About 90-97% | 88-92% |
| SpO ₂ target in higher group | 98% | About 97% | 91-100% | 97-100% | About 98-100% | 96-100% |
| Oxygenation achieved | | | | | | |
| Median SpO ₂ in lower group | 94% | 93% | Not reported | Not reported | 96% | About 93% |
| Median SpO ₂ in higher group | 97% | 96% | Not reported | Not reported | 97% | About 97% |
| Difference between groups | -3% | -3% | Not reported | Not reported | -1% | -3.8% |
| Median FiO ₂ in lower group | 0.31 | 0.43 | About 0.30 | 0.36 | 0.40 | About 0.40 |
| Median FiO ₂ in higher group | 0.45 | 0.56 | About 0.35 | 0.39 | 0.51 | About 0.50 |
| Difference between groups | -0.15 | -0.13 | About -0.05 | -0.03 | -0.09 | -0.15 |
| Mortality | In-hospital (28d) | 90 days | 90 days | In-hospital | In-hospital | 28 days |
| In lower target group | 34.8% | 42.9% | 34.7% | 24.2% | 32.2% | 34.3% |
| In higher target group | 33.2% | 42.4% | 32.5% | 33.9% | 31.3% | 26.5% |
| Difference between groups | 1.6% | 0.5% | 2.2% | -9.7% | 0.9% | 7.8% |

| Trial characteristic | PILOT | HOT-ICU | ICU-ROX | Oxygen-ICU | O ₂ -ICU | LOCO-2 |
|---|---|---|--|---------------------|---|---|
| Patients ventilated at enrollment | 2,541 | 1,704 | 965 | 291 | 295 | 201 |
| Time-to-enrollment | At initiation of ventilation in ED or ICU | Median of 4 hours after ICU admission | After ICU admission, median 3 hours after ventilation | At ICU admission | Median of 4 hours after ICU admission | After ICU admission, exact interval not reported |
| Target | SpO ₂ | PaO ₂ | SpO ₂ | PaO ₂ | PaO ₂ | PaO ₂ |
| SpO ₂ target in lower group | 90% | About 90% | 91-96% | 94-98% | About 90-97% | 88-92% |
| SpO ₂ target in higher group | 98% | About 97% | 91-100% | 97-100% | About 98-100% | 96-100% |
| Oxygenation achieved | | | | | | |
| Median SpO ₂ in lower group | 94% | 93% | Not reported | Not reported | 96% | About 93% |
| Median SpO ₂ in higher group | 97% | 96% | Not reported | Not reported | 97% | About 97% |
| Difference between groups | -3% | -3% | Not reported | Not reported | -1% | -3.8% |
| Median FiO ₂ in lower group | 0.31 | 0.43 | About 0.30 | 0.36 | 0.40 | About 0.40 |
| Median FiO ₂ in higher group | 0.45 | 0.56 | About 0.35 | 0.39 | 0.51 | About 0.50 |
| Difference between groups | -0.15 | -0.13 | About -0.05 | -0.03 | -0.09 | -0.15 |
| Mortality | In-hospital (28d) | 90 days | 90 days | In-hospital | In-hospital | 28 days |
| In lower target group | 34.8% | 42.9% | 34.7% | 24.2% | 32.2% | 34.3% |
| In higher target group | 33.2% | 42.4% | 32.5% | 33.9% | 31.3% | 26.5% |
| Difference between groups | 1.6% | 0.5% | 2.2% | -9.7% | 0.9% | 7.8% |

Strengths and Weaknesses

Strengths

- Moderately large sample size
- Key subgroups represented
- Few exclusion criteria
- Within clinical care
- Early enrollment

Weaknesses

- Single center
- Early enrollment precluded some baseline assessments
- Non-blinded
- SpO2 vs PaO2
- Collection of long-term outcomes is ongoing

Conclusion

 For mechanically ventilated critically ill adults, clinical outcomes do not differ between lower, intermediate, and higher SpO₂ targets.



Future Research (Methods)

- Cluster-crossover design & delivery of intervention by clinicians
 - Early intervention (at time of intubation in ED)
 - Separation between groups (despite 3 trial groups)
- Multiple crossovers
 - Understanding the trade off in statistical efficiency vs practicality
- Automated data collection from EHR every 1 minute:
 - Granular data on separation between groups, hypoxemia, hyperoxemia



Oxygen-ICU

- Population
 - 434 patients in single ICU w/ expected LOS>72h
 - 60% surgical
 - 55% respiratory failure
 - 66% mechanical ventilation

Intervention

- PaO₂ 70-100; SpO₂ 94-98%
- Control
 - PaO₂ up to 150; SpO₂ 97-100%
 - $FiO_2 \ge 0.4$

Outcomes

- ICU mortality: 12% vs 20% (RR 0.57, 95%CI 0.37-0.90)
- Less bacteremia, liver failure, shock

Notes

- Single center
- Stopped early at unplanned interim

JAMA | Preliminary Communication | CARING FOR THE CRITICALLY ILL PATIENT

Effect of Conservative vs Conventional Oxygen Therapy on Mortality Among Patients in an Intensive Care Unit The Oxygen-ICU Randomized Clinical Trial



ICU-ROX

Population

- 1,000 mechanically ventilated ICU pateints
- 30% surgical; 17% hypoxic ischemic encephalopathy
- 66% P/F<300

Intervention

- SpO2 target: 91-96%
 - FiO2 decreased to 0.21 if SpO2 >91%
 - Alarm for SpO2 values >96%
- Control
 - SpO2 target: 91-100%
 - FiO2 < 0.3 discouraged

Outcomes

- VFDs: 21 [0-26] vs 22 [0-26] (P=0.80)
- No difference in mortality or LTO

Notes

• Lower SpO2 target potentially better in hypoxic ischemic encephalopathy

Conservative Oxygen Therapy during Mechanical Ventilation in the ICU

The ICU-ROX Investigators and the Australian and New Zealand Intensive Care Society Clinical Trials Group*



LOCO-2

Population

- 201 mechanically ventilated ARDS patients
- Median P/F 120
- 70% on vasopressors

Interventions

- Higher PaO₂ target: 90-105 (SpO₂ 96-100%)
- Lower PaO₂ target: 55-70 (SpO₂ 88-92%)

Outcomes

- 28-day mortality: 34% vs 27%
- 90-day mortality: 44% vs 30%
- Mesenteric ischemia: 5 vs 0 events

Notes

• Trial stopped prematurely at interim

Liberal or Conservative Oxygen Therapy for Acute Respiratory Distress Syndrome



HOT-ICU

Population

2,928 ICU patients w/ AHRF on >10LPM O2 or >0.5 FiO2

- 14% surgical
- 60% mechanical ventilation
- Median P/F ratio 117

Interventions

- Higher PaO₂ target: 90 (range 82.5-97.5)
- Lower PaO₂ target: 60 (range 52.5-57.5)

Outcomes

- 90-day mortality: 43% vs 42% (RR 1.02, 95%CI 0.94-1.11)
- No difference in subgroups or secondary outcomes

Notes

• No difference in intestinal ischemia

Lower or Higher Oxygenation Targets for Acute Hypoxemic Respiratory Failure

O.L. Schjørring, T.L. Klitgaard, A. Perner, J. Wetterslev, T. Lange, M. Siegemund, M. Bäcklund, F. Keus, J.H. Laake, M. Morgan, K.M. Thormar, S.A. Rosborg, J. Bisgaard, A.E.S. Erntgaard, A.-S.H. Lynnerup, R.L. Pedersen, E. Crescioli,
T.C. Gielstrup, M.T. Behzadi, L.M. Poulsen, S. Estrup, J.P. Laigaard, C. Andersen, C.B. Mortensen, B.A. Brand, J. White, I.-L. Jarnvig, M.H. Møller, L. Quist,
M.H. Bestle, M. Schønemann-Lund, M.K. Kamper, M. Hindborg, A. Hollinger, C.E. Gebhard, N. Zellweger, C.S. Meyhoff, M. Hjort, L.K. Bech, T. Grøfte, H. Bundgaard, L.H.M. Østergaard, M.A. Thyø, T. Hildebrandt, B. Uslu,
C.G. Sølling, N. Møller-Nielsen, A.C. Brøchner, M. Borup, M. Okkonen, W. Dieperink, U.G. Pedersen, A.S. Andreasen, L. Buus, T.N. Aslam, R.R. Winding, J.C. Schefold, S.B. Thorup, S.A. Iversen, J. Engstrøm, M.-B.N. Kjær, and B.S. Rasmussen, for the HOT-ICU Investigators*



O2-ICU

Population

- 400 ICU patients with SIRS
- 25% surgical
- 75% invasive or non-invasive mechanical ventilation

Intervention

- Higher PaO₂ target: 105-135 (with max FiO2 0.6)
- Lower PaO₂ target: 60-90

Outcomes

- SOFArank: -35 (-63 to 0) vs -40 (-76 to -5) (median difference 10 [0 to 21]; P=0.06)
- 90-day mortality: 35% vs 34% (P=0.91)

Notes

- Single center
- Stopped early at unplanned interim

JAMA | Original Investigation | CARING FOR THE CRITICALLY ILL PATIENT

Effect of Low-Normal vs High-Normal Oxygenation Targets on Organ Dysfunction in Critically III Patients A Randomized Clinical Trial

Harry Gelissen, MD, MBA; Harm-Jan de Grooth, MD, PhD; Yvo Smulders, MD, PhD; Evert-Jan Wils, MD, PhD; Wouter de Ruijter, MD, PhD; Roel Vink, MD, PhD; Bob Smit, PhD; Jantine Röttgering, MD; Leila Atmowihardjo, MD; Armand Girbes, MD, PhD; Paul Elbers, MD, PhD; Pieter-Roel Tuinman, MD, PhD; Heleen Oudemans-van Straaten, MD, PhD; Angelique de Man, MD, PhD

